

**Chairperson:**

*Good morning everybody we are about to start the second leg of enquiry, we are going to be instructed the stage by people the great deal wise than ourselves where is previously we received and number of presentations in very general terms now we going to come down to more specific matters. We welcome the presenters, Professor Makgoba, and in this at this stage of the proceedings the Witnesses will give evidence under oath which is not being the case with the representers as far Professor would you give us your full names please.*

**Makgoba:**

*I'm Professor Malegapuru William Makgoba*

**Chairperson:**

*do you have any objections taking the oath?*

**Makgoba:**

*No*

**Chairperson:**

*Do you swear that the evidence that you will  
give me the truth the whole truth and nothing  
but the truth if you do raise your right hand it  
say "So Help Me God"*

**Makgoba:**

*So help me God*

**Chairperson:**

*thank you, you will be led by advocate Pillay and  
if you have any problems at any stage  
understanding the questions please don't  
hesitate to say so and take your time you are  
the witness we are not giving the evidence  
thank you.*

**Makgoba:**

*thank you.*

**Pillay:**

*Professor Makgoba, you and I have agreed a process for this morning and that's that you will make a mini presentation for 20 minutes and we will pose specific questions to you. If I could ask you before you begin your presentation, if you could just provide us some background, tell us what the National Planning Commission is, and what the purpose and the function of the commission is.*

**Makgoba:**

*Thank you Adv. Pillay, I think the NDC was appointed by the president almost 7 years ago to map out, first of all a vision and a plan over the next step I think is now maybe 16 years from now or 14 years to 2030 that will direct the*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*country in a coordinated coherent planning process and that process should be institutionalised across society, it would be a plan for the Society of South Africa and not a plan for any party or any particular stakeholder and the plan and division had to be developed through a process of wide consultations with many stakeholders and it had to go through the processes of approval finally being firstly approved I think in August I think 2012 the plan. the national development plan as it's called now has become almost duplicated by then the United Nations sustainable goals which were approved on the 15th of September last year so our national development plan has preceded what the rest of the world want to do in terms of a sustainable goals into the future it has about 14 I think goals and objectives and the sdgs are about 17 and if you were to read them they almost match each other word for word so that's really basically what about the National*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*Planning Commission does we are now in the second phase in which the commission in the second phase really its role is to advise a government was the elected body on the implementation of the objectives and goals of the NPC.*

**Pillay:**

*I just want to follow up question, if you just help us understand how it is the NDP, how it guides plans by individual departments. What is the inter-relationship between the planning process undertaken by individual departments, for example, the department for higher education and training and the contents of the NDP.*

**Makgoba:**

*First of all, the NDP and the National Planning Commission role is to ensure that planning is coordinated and coherent within government and the various Departments of government, secondary through the presidency it is to ensure that the plans are discussed by the cabinet of the country within cabinet so that one department knows what the objectives and goals of its plans as opposed to the other and they can plan in that coherent manner I think thirdly one of the things that seem to have been happening before is that when a new minister came he came with his pack of Wolves and they created a new structure in that department and then everything will start from scratch another minister comes with his hyenas to come and eat and then they have to go now or the idea of the Planning Commission was that the Planning Commission will remain a framework that every minister who comes into a portfolio follows the national objectives that are contained within*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*the NPC there for Planning become stable, steady, certain and it is independent of the Wings and wishes of a particular minister but also because it is done within cabinet it is done with the knowledge of cabinet their colleagues such that they are core or higher education or science and technology cannot simply plan Willy nilly without I think the colleagues in cabinet making a comment that maybe that is a from the outside objectives and It cannot be done that's really what it's all about.*

**Pillay:**

*that is very useful, thank you professor Makgoba. I think those are our introductory questions and please, if you may now proceed with the mini presentation.*

**Makgoba:**

*Thank you Judge and your panel and the leading people and the experts in higher education when I was asked to come and presented to this commission I struggled a lot as to what I really could tell the commission but they never the less I came to the conclusion that maybe in the noise that we're experiencing in our country about fees and the University of shutting down on and their properties been destroyed I will try and focus my attention to the value of a quality higher education system in a society in a modern society and I would use the chapter 9 of the NDP as a framework for the representation. chapter 9 is on pages said I think 295 to 327 it is a chapter that I was closely involved in in planning researching and writing and I thought I would use that I think I said as a document to present to this so the questions that was sent to me by the secretariat was that I had to address three things the policy framework of the NDP on post-school education and training the post-*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*school education and training targets that are in the NDP and this I call them the strategic levers for change and there in bad quality in them and where are there any issues of costing and financing now as I often say as a scientist I can answer this in three sentences and maybe we stop talking but I thought I'll provide some evidence so that I think they can be some some engagement so I'm going to deal with each of these very briefly and then we can take it from there on an evidence. the policy framework or just general outcome which is what you have already as me is that the NDP 2030 outcomes and mechanism really are about the NDP focusing on the eradication of poverty and reducing inequality and as you all would agree this requires an increase in growth in a more inclusive economy which creates jobs and income now education and this is a phrase that is contained in the NDP is the single most important investment*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*investment at country can make in its people  
and more importantly I think in it's yours  
education has intrinsic and instrumental value  
in creating societies that are better able to  
respond to the challenges of the 21st century  
life long learning continues and continuous  
professional development and knowledge  
production alongside Innovation are central to  
building the capability division of societies and  
Society as a whole now in South Africa  
education has to have quality is education has  
to have quality anywhere in the world otherwise  
it's meaningful meaning less and useless in our  
society embedded in our constitution it's history  
of diversity which is embedded in the society in  
which you believe the third leg of this is  
education in our society has to transform  
because the constitution in or engenders us to  
transform the society to create a new Society so  
you can't read that buy just keeping on the old  
rules you've got to change all it's systems and*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*Policy and fundamentals in order to create a this new society that we all aspired for in the constitution this is a very important statement I think that is contained I Think game chapter 9 of of the post-school Why is education so Central and then maybe I'm talking about higher education also called post-school education and training it's central because it important for the development and growth of citizens how citizens I shaved in society it's shape by the education system in which Dave Grohl and socialise themselves of course education is important for the education and it's important for the economy so education supports quality learning and teaching in the entire education system from childhood to adulthood I think to the time when we device it's it's a process of education that is important of course education support research and knowledge for the knowledge system and Technology system in any country that is*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*important for the economy it's important for  
Innovation it's important for authorisation for  
the transfer of that knowledge system it also  
response to the skills needs the professionals of  
the country the engineers the doctors the  
lawyers that I here today we are all coming  
from education system so it is really important  
for the professional in fact most of you might  
know that the University system when it started  
in port for lawyer around the 1600 it was about  
actually trying to provide the professional class of  
the society in order to get society is organised in  
addition to developing knowledge that would  
eliminate the world Those Were the ways of fair  
Emperor barboza around 1688 when the  
University of Bologna was started to illuminate  
the world with knowledge but also to create a  
professional class that would provide the system  
for government societies and for conducting  
Society so education is important for learning  
and research for Active and why citizens in the*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*social science but is also now become part of globalisation and partnerships as I said 21 colleague in the old days my University which says the form University of Natal friend had relationships with British universities because it was part of my Colonial history I could never have a relationship with university in France because I didn't speak French and we have no relationship with friends but today because of the globalisation and the world ranking I can have relationship with their with a university in Brazil I can have relationship with university in India I Can Never in China so the recognition system of international recognition is being shared by the trends of higher education that has a r. Because of the quality you can decide the situation is a quality I want to partner it or they want to partner you and thatthat change is saved by the quality of knowledge the quality of your Peers and the quality of the recognition system that is no longer based I think on the*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*colonial model of countries that speaks the same language so here are the underlying policies that you wanted me to answer the first one is the education white paper of 1997 called a program for transformation high education it was followed by the white paper on science and technology that was around 1996 report on the national working group in 2002 and then inside the Ministerial review committee on science and technology in 2012 the green paper on post-school education in 2012 and the global trends in higher education in the bricks in the World Bank studies and the development of world-class University I want to point out that all these documents rhyme anymore I have been very intimately involved in them in the drafting in the debates in so far so I'm familiar with them as much as I can be both in science and education and in the global trends that are taking place in higher education essay for my Vice Chancellor so let me come*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*then to that the general recommendations of the National Planning Commission I think in light of those documents when we were preparing this chapter we identified three issues for post-school education and training that it has to expand and grow its capacity because it is providing access and success and sustainability into the future and the estimate was about 30% we also found that the education system in that industry in I had to improve quality and success rates but because of the constitution and the way we run a country we had to exploit the diversity and a difference in the system that must respond to the needs of the country and improve and you must improve with quality now let me go to the specific items quality education requires three factors and one of the factors is the rise in demand for this commission everywhere in the world if you want to build a quality higher education on post-school education you require 3 things*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*required Talent of people you require resources to finance the system and you require a favourable regulatory and the have and their regulatory and their framework for governance now I borrowed a slide from a well Bank studies done by Jamal - it's a book that was said presented around 2011 on the establishment of world-class University and their studies University in different countries and how they become quality institutions because they represent the pinnacle and the jewel in the crown of the education system if you don't ground quality the system suffers across the board so you require a concentration of Thailand abundant resources which is in South Africa is the fees fees fees but I will talk to them a little bit and a supportive fair regulatory framework which I'll comment on I could have actually and cut my talk on the slide a loan but I'm going to talk to each one of this a little bit so that I can provide evidence that the required the*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*first the first target and the most important Target to ground the post school education in South Africa is to get the qualification of the staff correct unit quality stuff to provide quality teaching and quality research in the system now I put a finger their of 75% because it is the recommendation in the chapter that says we must improve the qualification of our stuff from the 34% to 75 and I'm sure some of that everything's leaders must be asking where did they get this numbers from firstly we've got the numbers of 34%staff by conducting a study that was done by the Academy of Science of South Africa looking at the whole system in South Africa University system and say what is the percentage of our staff that hold a PhD at the time it was 34% it has improved is slightly to 42% now and then I went around the world and ask myself what is the average PhD percentage of South in the best university in the car in the world and there was a study conducted in China*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*of the top 500 university in the world, the top 500 universities in the world and if you look at the average percentage qualification of their PhD in the average was 75% so we feel that if we need to was the average it would be a good start for our country to aim towards the average person to say that in Brazil at the University of Sao Paulo 95% of the staff of God PSG is the top 200 universities that the staff percentage of PS this is about 82% so but if you talk about the top 500 in the world depending on whatever ranking use 75% of the staff hold a PhD now somebody may I ask why is it important to hold a PhD at the answer comes in this light if you look at the correlation between research productivity and Innovation in any country the correlation between holding a PC and innovation and research is .9 percent is 90% which means people who hold a PhD in a university of the most productive and they are the most innovative and through Innovation to*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*UJ legendary tall is Industrial Development jobs in support of course I can also say that at the University of KwaZulu-Natal when we get the study 5 years ago it was .75 so that is a very strong correlation between why you want the quality of the teaching and research stuff to hold a PC in any system of post-school education and training now if you come to South Africa and ask about yourself you will find that we we made the recommendation that you must produce about 5000 phds at the moment as you can see we are producing roughly about 1500 if you look at at the figures that are up there we produced 3 per hundred thousand and I didn't give you take our population to be about 50 million it translates to vote 1500 in total Italy produces about 18 career about 23 so it was actually feel that if we really needed to be competitive we needed to Bumper that figure to about at about 10 instead of 3 so you needed to increase It*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*almost three fold and it will translate into a figure that is in the in the chapter is about 5000 pieces that we need to to to to produce so the Tigers that was said are scientifically sound they based on research there based on comparative analysis but they are important I think to create a system of quality that infuses the rest of the education system in a country and in a society and give the direction for the future the next one which may be consensus you more than I will ever think is the fees if you are the resources that should be abundant and it looks like you a lot is that South Africa spends about. 71 on Higher Education as a percentage of GDP. Cuba spends 4.47 now all of you know that we are much richer than Cuba how are you claim is bigger than Cuba but you may also give free education to all it students in higher education so so the priority is not money, it's choice, what you want to do is sleep nothing to do with money we have no money but they are spending*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*a large percentage of the GDP on the education investment of their children We are spending I don't know .71 having a rich country but were able to do other things that are naughty and an exciting rather than invest in the future*

**Chairperson:**

*Sorry, by choice do you mean the judgement of what is a government priorities?*

**Makgoba:**

*Yes, the choice of the Nation. for example in South Africa we say education is Apex number one in the country but actually the budget is not number 1 so you you make a choice you talk about it in the public but you actually don't put the investment that is necessary to make that choice a reality and any necessary because in life there is no choice for which there are no*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*consequences if I used to buy a motorcar I may not be able to afford to build a palace so you always have to trade of the choices that you make and the reason why I put up this life that is Brazil there is 8.95% brother Brazil provides free education from for tertiary education up to a doctorate it is in the BRICS, India it's at one point to Ghana is it 1.44 and all of these things are about choices rather than about the economy*

**Chairperson:**

*May I just ask as it occurs that this doesn't mean very much to me unless one knows what the pie looks like as a whole because I can only then judge what the choices mean in relation to all the other choices that are available to us so if I was you look at the pie in Cuba I might find that it has a 20 divisions of which education is only one. Whereas the pie in South Africa*

**Chairperson: \*Continued\***

*maybe made up of 200 divisions of which of education is only one and the .71 May represent in relation to the to the pie a greater proportion of expenditure then it doesn't Cuba if you understand what I'm saying that we may have more and more things to deal with the Cuba does*

**Makgoba:**

*I take your point but I want to make a different kind of point, and the point I wanna try and make is this let's suppose I gave you a hundred rands and say what do you want to do with hundred rands you can make that choice and said I want to go and buy a car I want to send my children to university I want to make sure that make my house is properly secured and sulphur this offer now in this country we have made a choice that we have publicly spoken about that Education Health and other things*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*out our priorities now whatever we have we have that pie What We Have Done is we haven't pirate eyes the budget of our country into that pie and make the heart races for example do we need to abort the f- is that we bought for the arms deal in a country that is desperately in need of Education that's where the trade-off should take place that has every country needs security every country needs education every country needs how and so forth how do I structure the pie now what we have done in South Africa is inherited a pie but not decided in in this new environment is the spy still relevant or should we actually change it and say that I must now change if we say we want to invest in education we are then going to take money from decor over going to take it from defence because the primary' mean the same so at the end of the day she wants to educate their children weather there are 25 or not it has made the priority that that's our in that pie*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*application is top in South Africa we have said education is top but in the pie it does not received the power and the top of the budget and that's the hard choice that we make and that's why will be made by the commission like yourself but it is a choice of trade-offs as to what is important for relation to develop into the future using the power that you have and nothing more than that I hope I've made my point A little bit clearer.*

**Chairperson:**

*You have but I still don't quite understand whether you can look at Cuba and save 4.6 and South Africa at .7 and say that represents the relative importance that we have attached to each of them.*

**Makgoba:**

*You can because that comparison is it's very clear because I said it's based on the pie and within the pie what your prioritise and give us a percentage it doesn't matter I mean there are several of ice here it was given hundred rands we are not going to privatize in the same way as individuals ourselves.*

**Chairperson:**

*Let me give an example, in Cuba it may be that there are really a very limited number of sports facilities, perhaps soccer, baseball and where is in South Africa Department of Sport may have to consider 20 different sports I'm only taking this is a possibility that may mean that sport in Cuba is given a much lower priority in the scale and Money doesn't have to be spent upon it in the same way as would be spent in South Africa and that may be repeated in in many different*

**Chairperson: \*Continued\***

*ways and so I don't know that one can say that they are not that they may have more money to spend on education than we have.*

**Makgoba:**

*I don't know you can make that argument, I frankly don't think that I can support will will will hold water if if they don't prioritise sports and we prioritise sports, there must be a reason why we do so all I'm trying to say is that we have prioritised education, as a country I think that is common cause but when you look at the resources that are allocated to it- it doesn't reflect that priority it really tells you that what we have done and I'm going to be blunt here that we came into the new dispensation with a model of budgeting that was part of the past and all we did was tinker around that budgeting framework even though we speak to the public there and say this is our*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*priority it's not the priority is not accompanied by a shift, a fundamental shift in the resources that are allocated to what we defined the public as a priority it is simply being that ok in 1963 the budget of the country was struck in the following way in 2016 it still the same framework but the priorities have changed.*

**Chairperson:**

*Can you for example deal with health in the same context? Now we regard health as a priority I think. How have we prioritised health from the budget through your point of view?*

**Ally:**

*Just before you continue, I need you to take this into consideration also, because what I'm getting from you is there's a principle involved in terms of budgeting and you need to*

**Ally: \*Continued\***

*understand the process of budgeting it is what I'm getting from you is this you cannot isolate your priorities from your budgeting process because you can have a mismatch as in your words we have at present*

**Makgoba:**

*correct*

**Ally:**

*so if you say education is number one budget should be number one let's assume number one is defence and yet on the priority list it's number 5 what you are saying is the skew-ness in terms of the budgeting process visa V the priorities that you have set up as a country so in light of that perhaps you then can use the chairperson's question.*

**Makgoba:**

*All I'm trying to say maybe I agree with the advocate Ally that when you when you are a restructuring or changing either a country or a system you define your vision and your objectives clearly, you set out your resources in accordance to that vision, what we have done in South Africa is to have a vision but that vision has not been followed by the resources in the manner in which we saved it is just being SA say we we have the switch of a great country but we don't actually locate the appropriate resources because that has been a system that has been comfortable for rust just Tinker with and we are never ask yourself when we say health is a pirate which were trying to do at the moment was struggling with side to Paradise have as well in the transformation and their the establishment of the energy to find the appropriate resources that are going to underpin that changed because it's going to transform the health system so the. I'm trying to*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*get dried is this that you cannot set a vision and not allow the resources of the country to be reshaped differently but continuing tinkering using the old system which is what we have been doing if you actually look at I've looked at the budget process of South Africa it is not change from since 1963 it is just being the process of Tinker and that's why that's why did I have this maybe that's why did I just current strife between how the National Treasury works for example you have people from The National Treasury hear that came and told you that they have and budgeted for the fee increase there is no money in The Budget then and listen to the minister of finances Afrikaan on corruption by 25% we have 40 billion so and this is to the public so if you can't buy a hundred percent you have 160 million then you must ask yourself what resources do you require actually to deal with this so-called fees fees if you don't actually requirement and 40 billion but you have it stuck*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*somewhere because if I may use my word we have prioritised corruption we can deal with it because with no choice but to pay but something that we can plan for which is education we have decided it's a priority that we can talk to the public but the resources are not following it in the system.*

**Pillay:**

*You mentioned it has been recognised as an APEX priority in the NDP and has been accepted as such.*

**Makgoba:**

*Not only in the NDP, politically. If you feel reason to the ruling party what do they say? The APEX priority is education.*

**Pillay:**

*Why doesn't it translate into greater percentage of GDP in the budget so who takes that decision? And that's what we need to get into grips with.*

**Makgoba:**

*that's why I'm saying that is the decisions that is taken by the cabinet of the country and that is the decision that we in the Planning Commission can only make a recommendation remember when you give advice you don't force anybody but the advice that the NPC gives is based on we have a vision let's let the resources of a country be shaped by the vision and the strategy of the country we want to create what will not happen is for us to have a strategy and the vision and things that somehow Manna will fall from Heaven and when they will wake up and the country will ok it was ok that way we have a budget and what is a budget budget is an*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*instrument to realise the objectives and goals of what do you want to create and I think we have not been hard enough on ourselves as a nation to say let the money for the ideas and division of the country want to create an Den dats why that slide around Cuba is not a mistake or around Ghana this are not it's not because we have 30 priorities and they have 20 is because they have decided that the future of the country lies in the educational system that they want to have*

**Khumalo:**

*just prof-*

**Pillay:**

*the high-level policy decision as to how the pie gets curved up, are you saying that decision is taken back by cabinet?*

**Makgoba:**

*let me let me put it this way this is what I think I know the high level of budget is decided by cabinet but it is prepared by National Treasury to be presented to carbonate National Treasury goes through a process of preparing the budget that goes to cabinet now let me*

**Khumalo:**

*Whilst you're on the budget, I wanted to check, you have looked at the system that is there and you have- has there been any thought into what possibly could change? Is it the actual process or is the legislative framework that makes the budget not to follow the priority?*

**Makgoba:**

*Actually I can share this with you as I'm quite comfortable, I think in the NPC we have come to that understanding that it would appear that the objectives are not being followed by the*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*resources and our main struggle at the moment is to convince and to make a strong recommendation that as long as the division is there and their objectives are there and their not followed by resources they we won't realise the dream but remember that you are not dealing with an ideal system here as soon as you say the resources must follow the vision every minister says "is it me who's resources are going to be diminished" and again it boils down to what I call Leadership and guts and courage because what is it that were trying to create we want to accept that the vision is what we want to live by certain things have to go we can't keep on adding in the vision when we don't have a growing economy or resources that are abundant we have to say this I think you must have under this you must cut this we must increase and that is the hard choice that South Africans are not able to make you are not you are able to dream you are able to wish but when it comes to the kinds of*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*making a decision in Salem I must sacrifice  
defence for education I must sacrifice in our  
international relations for for education we  
don't make that decision hard enough although  
we know what we want has SA won singer said  
we all want to go to heaven but nobody wants  
to die and Dice that is the problem we have in  
South Africa and that is the challenge this  
commission is faced.*

**Chairperson:**

*Its liked facing a brick wall.*

**Makgoba:**

*I don't know but as I say we have observed that  
in in the commission when you look at the  
division that has been accepted and the  
resources how they are located and how they  
are followed you don't match each other that is  
a mismatch and what we have been able to do*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*is that we have now been roped into the process of trying to deal with that meeting of resources and division how well it to go it is something that were just starting but this is this is an issue in SA say how many degrees in a dress is bankrupt that I can see we all know that but it provides free higher education so we have countries that a man friend we are not why not yet but that are you now let me finish this is this is the governance framework that I want to talk about me five conclude basically we have a governance framework and Ryan features in that fact governance framework don't want to comment about very briefly what is academic freedom and one is leadership and their last one is culture of accidents I think in South Africa that is academic freedom is a team signed as part of our constitution that University autonomy but I think we have spent most of our time in contestation about academic freedom and as to how it facilitates the change the system I have*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*to say is universities are led by councils and they are led by vice-chancellors and the executive teams now if you really take a comparative analysis some of the councils of universities in our country a waste and the SABC board and and of course the vice-chancellor of a university is something that requires to be interrogated because in most countries that I've worked and lived in a vice Chancellor's of the contribution as scholars and I'm not sure that we follow that crazy there in South Africa if you were to if you were to if you were to take for example a vice Chancellor's South Africa and printing in England which is a place of work with most of all vice-chancellors would not be even senior lecturers that's what does the highest they would be so somehow or another in the governance of the of the system that cancels a week in the Vice chancellors are not of the highest quality that we can get and if you don't change that it doesn't matter how much money you put into a system you end up with a rotten*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*system not let me come to the costing and financing which is the last bed and I'll just deal with this in one sentence when we were preparing this chapter we engage with two department Department of Science and Technology Department of Higher Education we provided the chapters to this to both departments and they responded they understood that were financial implications for the targets that were said and they agreed to that and as I say this tigers were based on on some research and so forth and finally commission I wanted to say that I tried to paint a picture that quality higher education is important in any society and it would be an important investment in the future of our society is South Africa because quality higher education or post-school education and training it's indispensable for national development for the identity of any nation and for its cohesion and is global competitiveness and gross we*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*always need to maintain our competitive advantage in the generation of knowledge ever the most important thing you have to learn to do and you have to be strong about is that you invest in the teaching and research staff for the future of the higher education system I say this because academics don't often protest, they don't burn buildings but without them you have no higher education and these are the people that are quiet terrified suffering uncertain of the future and the other core of the higher education system and I urge or plead with this commission just think about that that's why the investment of our GDP into higher education it's important to ensure that our higher education system is sustainable, it's certain it stable and it's no more nervous like it is right now and you can only do that by really thinking about this people who don't make noise but I actually the car of what happens in higher education in his quality as somebody said if you about Investec*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*investing in higher education you must think about what ignorance with course if you invest in it I think I will stop there and I can take I can take care I can take any questions not only related to the spirit lead to any other thing you want to ask in higher education thing is that I'm retired- I can say what I like*

**Pillay:**

*Thank you prof Makgoba maybe I can take you two steps back, and we know that in June 2011 before the NDP was published, the NPC released a vision statement and a diagnostic report, now the vision statement draws largely from the principle set out in the bill of rights, so obviously the NPC applied its mind to the question of what section 29-1 means and what the obligation of government is in relations to this section and to the promotion and realisation of section 29-1*

**Pillay: \*Continued\***

*maybe you would like to share with us what was the NPC's views on section 29-1 is what is the obligation on government?*

**Makgoba:**

*Firstly I must confess I'm not a lawyer and so I often I don't remember the sections of the bills of rights. But I can only say that the constitution, freedom charter were perhaps the grounding documents around not only in terms of this chapter that were discussing but I think it permitted the whole of the NPC particularly in the formation of its vision and looking at its chapter everything was almost always grounded on the constitution and a section of the constitution and the Freedom Charter as we understood it and translated it at the time.*

**Pillay:**

*So what does the right to further education mean? And what does it require of government?*

**Makgoba:**

*I think there's a section there that says that I think every citizen has the right to educate- everyone has a right to Basic Education, further education and everyone has the various rights that are spelled in there, and as they say we didn't translate that word-for-word but we took both the spirit of what was said there and infused it in the development of the of the NPC in relation to each of the chapter remember that our mandate was to prepare a document in terms of plan and vision that was for the society and the people of South Africa and anchoring it within the various sections of the constitution was essential and as I say the Freedom Charter so that's basically what we did there.*

**Pillay:**

*If I can understand, when the constitution guarantees the right to further education which the state has to through reasonable measure progressively realise- what you do see in the NDP is how that that translates into planning too, what was seen as being immediately realisable and what is then progressively realisable in terms of the right to further education?*

**Makgoba:**

*No actually what you see in the NDP it's a plan that is based on not simply on the constitution but as I said to you what is happening in the world and who are competitors and how do we compete or how do I catch up. so that their the chapter and it's targets it's more than simply translate in the constitution it takes a much broader view of what's happening in the world what lessons can we learn and what are the*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*Tigers that we can try and save and actually as I tried to indicate that has the lowest setting where the minimum of dealing with a system that has suffered obviously the ravages of our past and we are trying to improve on that and you couldn't couldn't send it at the high level where it inhibits that actually was in what is impossible so nobody actually in the sector never said that does tigers were impossible because and not only did we discuss it with the department but we discussed it with various experience in education we discussed it with various experts in science science and technology for example Prof Louis soon on the Ministerial committee on the landscape of Science and Technology Michael Kahn was part of the heart and Nico Pluto was part of the higher education system that were talking to and so forth in a people in there in the rankings Global ranking system like people Phill Barty and in the High Times higher so I were talking*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*with there a lot of people in order to create that targets that could be reachable with in South Africa that are realistic and that could be managed financially and that's why this chapter was submitted and subjected to both Ministry to understand that there are financial implications for what were recommending this are the targets that have been said and some of the targets actually came from their own white papers so it was not like something that they're the idea that qualification must improve it at actually come from some of our Educationists the country the idea that you must have a certain number of Dr outputs came from the science and technology community you know if I used to chair the national science and technology forum so I understand some of the arguments as to what did we need to do to improve the system the constitution is the groundwork but the parameters that ultimately*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*led to the Tigers and their costing in a general sense came from all the other stakeholders that we had to engage.*

**Pillay:**

*And from the planning commission's perspective, looking at the right under section 29-1 be that further education which must be progressively realised, do you accept that at one point maybe not immediately but at some point there has to be free education free higher education for all?*

**Makgoba:**

*I am of The View that as a country we can afford free Higher Education and that's my honest view, I think I think we can afford it for everybody because I think that the money is there in our country we are just not prioritising*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*it properly If We Ever Really sit down and ask yourself what are the two or three most important priorities and if we do that we must know were going to fund them of course there are other priorities in the country, they're going to suffer but those are the hard Choices We Make all the time so I believe free education is affordable of course like all Democrats I think I'll be persuaded by the evidence that come and you know that is a country I didn't talk about that but actually provide free higher education, it's England Great Britain ok in Great Britain most parents that are used not to pay for their children to go to school to university and what is used to happen there the model that used to use that was that if you resided in a counsel the counsel paid for your child to be at university didn't matter where they were. so as a parent you pay your taxes through the National Insurance system and it guaranteed that wherever your child apply for university they get*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*taken care of and you didn't pay anything but they never called it free education I'm a beneficiary of that system, two of my kids were educated I didn't have to pay anything The Council were the lived, they got paid for. They neve shouted they were doing free education and they are not as rich as we think they are.*

**Pillay:**

*The difference and emphasis Prof, I'm trying to arrive at the question of the right standing separate for the moment the question of affordability, do you then accept your submission that every person out there has the right to further education? As we speak.*

**Makgoba:**

*Everybody has the right to further education but we know that not everybody is capable of further education, I think that will be scientific,*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*but everybody has got the right and there are people who are capable to be taken through further education and I think the current country should be able to assist them in that kind of aspiration.*

**Pillay:**

*Just moving onto the next topic, chapter 9 deals with four levels of education, It deals with ECD, basic education, the PSET, then it deals with national research and innovation systems, now can we find out from you, from the NPC's perspective, amongst these four levels of education, is there an approach which prioritises one level of education over the other or are they all to be treated equally?*

**Makgoba:**

*It's debatable, you shouldn't prioritise one over the other in a normal society you shouldn't do that because I tried provide an argument as to why a post-school education is important in society but remember that we not coming from a normal Society so early childhood learning it's actually very very important in our country basic education is very very important in our country further adult educator because of our history I saw you at this particular point as I say taking the history of our country into account I would say I would not necessarily be able to prioritise although you might have to make hard choices and staggered and you might have to stagger them of a time and say it maybe we should spend time on this issue and see what is gives us and then and so forth but there but because of the history of the country I think we are almost anyway almost left with too many challenges in this area of Education.*

**Pillay:**

*And within the context where you are dealing with fee limited resources, was there any discussion within the NPC about how to best allocate resources up to the different levels of education?*

**Makgoba:**

*As I said to you, we didn't go into the details and maybe it comes back to what I tried to say at the beginning, when you are in the realm of Leadership you paint a picture, you are painting a picture for people in each one of you looked at the picture and you won't see the same thing to leadership is about providing that big picture because the details are a much more the much more instrumental and often very difficult the important thing about the costing of this plans that I'm talking about was that I think each chapter within the*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*NPC was often discussed with the relevant departments and it was always understood that the financial implications remember that we were working on the premise that the economy would grow that about 5% we have achieved that infect Move It Follows the opposite and so even if you believe in even if I have costed it at the time it will look stupid today to talk about it because there is no money so so that costing was I think what in English they call a gentleman's agreement and understanding that we have a vision and we have a picture and that picture is gonna require trade offs and does trade offs are going to be around limited resources but never the less they are trade offs because we are passionate about what we want to do we are passionate about the future of the country and the direction of the country so they're the costing was never detailed remember that there was actually at the time former Minister of Finance so that they*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*understood all these maybe even better than myself but I was very pleased because when I took the chapter to the minister of Higher Education and the Minister of Science and Technology they understood that the investment far more ouways is actually the immediate money and maybe it is also a philosophy that we we we we are underestimate in South Africa, ideas are more important than Money. mankind has developed out of ideas rather than money there are no Nobel laureates in families of rich people in the world so money is money is important money is useful but money is not the most important thing for the development of a nation today it is the ideas because it is the ideas that generate economies is the ideas that make children confident the ideas that make children compete with others confidently and they're not gonna do that they simply because of money you're going to do that because the right people with*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*ideas people can drive those ideas and make sure that they are care and most achievements of Humankind that have comes through the university system have not been through money they been through a big ideas that have changed shape the world so so I'm not underestimating I know your challenges about money but there but they're from where I come from, values and Big Ideas are the most important thing that say people and their future.*

**Chairperson:**

*That's why I take it the percentage of GDP isn't a matter of quantifying the percentage so much as the principle of devoting the greater proportion?*

**Makgoba:**

*As I- I take your point that calculating it right to the cent is not important but it is the big idea and principle that we are- that what I was trying to- it's more of the principle rather than the proportions I put there, I was just illustrating that because, when you listen to our politicians they all go to Cuba and buy some cigars there and come back, so they know the country very well. So its easier to talk to people about countries they understand and aspire to be and ofcourse you would have thought they could have asked Castro and say "how did you do it because we want to do the same thing in South Africa" but it doesn't look like that.*

**Pillay:**

*The NPD identifies a number of goals that South Africa has set for itself, the first is eradicating poverty, the second is growing the economy by 5.4% and the third is cutting unemployment rate to 6% by 2030 now but what it does do in*

**Pillay: \*Continued\***

*the chapter 9 is that it states that education training and innovation just very much along the line of what you have just described now are critical to the attainment of these goals and infact when you read the chapter when you- you get a very overwhelming sense of the fact that the NDP seems to postulate how higher education and training as a public good rather than a private good.*

**Makgoba:**

*Higher education, universities are a public good and maybe I will frame this argument this way. You know there are two institutions that assisted the development of mankind. On institution is the church I can't talk about it a lot, I'm not a bishop. The other institution is higher education, mankind is where we are today because of universities and higher education, so I would argue that higher*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*education and the development of mankind are synonymous. Our development is highly dependant, no institution except the church allows us to pray to go to heaven, I don't know how many of us end up there but I do know how many people actually benefit from higher education. So it's a very old institution and it served mankind very well. But also lets remember that actually higher education started through the church but more importantly it was actually started by Kings and Monarchs and people were actually very authoritarian in the approach but somehow or another they gave it the freedom and the autonomy to be outside their domain so that it could be reflective of society and be able to be independent. so there is a very secret principles that have shaped the way higher education operates and that's why I said higher education whether you call it university is a post-school it it represents the pinnacle of the education*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*system that has shaped mankind and I'm not speaking unbiased here I think I am biased because it's a system I grow up in but it is it is one system where there's plenty of evidence that the development of mankind is closely associated with the quality of the education system of where people originated, it is one system where there's enough evidence to say all the innovations that you have seen that have shaped the future of mankind come from those people that have been through University systems in one way or another it is a very important system that that it's easy to ignore because it's small it's full of very noiseless people that are highly professional and sad don't make too much noise they're the only sector that makes know if there is the students were obviously I think the lifeblood of the future of Higher Education but this commission I want to implore and their played with them that it is very small sector that is called higher education*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*is what has brought I see all of you are products of Higher Education you wouldn't be arguing looking for everything we had not learned for my education so we are the products of that system and let's try and shape it in a manner that retains the fundamental qualities or improve the fundamental qualities so that our system is able to compete and is able to be sustained into the future you know I'm 64 today and 2030 I'll be close to 80, so why am I arguing in this because I won't be there I may be in a mental hospital demented or something like that. it's because the shape and the future of the country matters to some of you as it matters to me it's not my future is the future of the children we see dancing and fighting for free education that I'm here today. it's their future but I would like they are future to have been shaped by an idea that I can contribute to this Commission that's all I'm trying to do.*

**Pillay:**

*Do you have any submissions on the appropriateness of the cost-sharing module that's currently being used where parents have to contribute towards the cost of their children's higher education?*

**Makgoba:**

*No, I think there are lots of contributions and there are lots of clever economists and models that are being presented to the commission, all I know is that our country has enough money to provide tertiary education to everybody what model we come with it will be a democratic process, What we must not fall ourselves that there is no money the minister of finances told us that, who better knows that than him? we have money publicly, it isn't an issue so if you don't believe in making my second I'm not the part of the Hawks but they all I know is that I trust Pravin Gordon very much to know that he*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*wouldn't say what he said very likely I think you said it in August someone in The Press Club and said if you cut corruption by 25% you'll have 40 billion rands so it means if you cut it by 100%, multiply 40 by 4 you have 160 billion if the Minister of Finance says that I think this commission should close and say minister give us the money and then we have then then your job is finished*

**Chairperson:**

*Perhaps we should tell government how to cut corruption first.*

**Makgoba**

*That looks like that looks like the issues but it also looks like they have prioritised corruption, they have money to pay for it. But they don't have money to pay for higher education. What kind of contradiction is this? That's why the*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*principle for me is very important to me, no matter how you look at some of these countries, you must ask yourself, if we say in the freedom charter that education or the doors of learning must open, we say in our constitution that there's a right to everybody to further education. And we say publicly in our election manifesto that the free education is coming, we repeat it in various meetings of the ruling party and other parties over the years and say its coming whether it was in polokwane or Mangaung and so on we tell the public and now the kids are saying "lets have it". And we say "oh we are still going to think about it" what are we saying? And then we tell them there's no money but the finance minister says there is money, so who are they going to believe? I think we should maybe call the minister of finance to this commission Because it may be the quickest answer what we are looking for. If he thinks theres money and you think you can make the*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*recommendation then the commission is closed.*

*You save the country some little bit of money*

*too,*

**Ally:**

*Prof perhaps it's not is as simple as that, I*

*understand that that's how you see it in terms*

*of and that's how the students Minister of*

*Finance said there's money so what are you*

*doing here however as with your process in the*

*NPC there is a process in order to get it to a*

*conclusion there and and I think it it needs to be*

*understood like we spoke earlier on of your*

*budgetary process and you the planning cycle as*

*it were those are processes that you need to*

*follow and what the evidence leaders are trying*

*to do and having called you here from my*

*perspective as a commissioner is to understand*

*the policy framework that has led the NDP to*

*read the way it reads and therefore if we don't*

*understand that Policy Framework then we*

**Ally: \*Continued\***

*gonna be missing each other along the way and  
it I don't think it's it's it's beneficial to anyone to  
be Utopian and not realistic in that Utopia also  
so along the way you must bear with us and and  
because I know you've gone through the process  
having been part of this commission and still  
part of the NPC so we are all time to make sure  
that the end of the day that everybody reads  
from the same page*

**Makgoba:**

*no I take your point And I appreciate that and I I  
do understand the value and the nature of the  
process we are also struggling with this process  
is so I'm not underestimating that that day but  
let me just make one correction I don't think I'm  
Utopian without evidence so I think the  
evidence speaks for itself and it's not coming  
from me it's coming from other people that I  
believe know better than I do know you know if*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*your Bank manager tells you your money who are you to argue with him? Just go and spend the money. There is nothing Utopian about that who is our Bank manager? Pravin Gordan, so it doesn't matter what you say mandarins come and tell you here the buck stops with him so that's why I say you must call him here so that he can clarify for you and then you stop in at the moment obviously you are trying to "complexify" the issue it's complex I'm saying it's simple and those areas that you have to deal with because I listen to Pravin, you say it's complex because you listen to other economist and with other people of who have got morals that are much clever, so you say it's it's one of those things but somebody you've got to believe in some authority, and this is a Pravin hold the key to the bank-*

**Chairperson:**

*Prof, we did listen to the Mandarin who came from the department of finance and it was suggested to us that if you increase VAT you can do this, it does seem to be a matter of priorities, if you choose to do so you can probably do it not in unusual channels but in the usual financial channels, but it may well be that we've heard presentations that there are unusual channels of thinking out of the box, which could also be adapted and used. May I just ask a question in relations to the recent NDP, supposing there were doubling the percentage of the NDP I assume that that benefit would be spread amongst the education field as a whole?*

**Makgoba:**

*Well when I was asked to come and present here, I was asked specific questions that's why I'm trying to limit my presentation to the area I was asked to address, the point I'm trying to*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*make it that we are dealing with fees must fall, I just want to plead that lets hope that when the fees have fallen, the university system or higher education system of our country has not disappeared that's it that's a very important thing now one of the ways to deal with it is to understand that the fees and the stabilisation and certainty that you want to bring into the University or the post school education system, they are two parts of the same coin you want to stabilize the system for its own whatever it's its own sustainability but you also want to deal with this issue now of fees, now whether you deal with this issue by increasing taxes taxation or you deal with it By trade-offs in tables within various department that may have to go to cabinet and be debated as to how the priorities are aligned to the resources that there are various ways you can deal with this matter but let's not create the impression out there that this is impossible or it so difficult maybe that's*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*why I have got a simplistic view that whatever else this commission comes up with it will have followed obviously the logic of the presentations that have listen to and what is feasible and so forth and they say whatever you come up with doesn't matter what I believe In, it will be the wisdom of having considered all the factors that you were asking me what do I believe in have told you and I told you the reasons why I believe in what I believe in and then I don't think those I just pies in the sky there are reasons that are based on evidence that I've seen and I heard about and I do participate in the budget process so I understand it a little bit.*

**Pillay:**

*Just on the question of the .7-1 % of GDP towards Higher Education and Training the NDP does mention that at some point in the NDP stated that the amount is insufficient to meet the current commitment of higher education*

**Pillay: \*Continued\***

*institutions and let alone the on-going the address of target set out in the NDP and we know that the less than 1% allocation has been an ongoing thing it it's not a new thing has there been any engagement by the NPC with cabinet with the department of higher education or even the Minister of Finance of the Ministry of finance National Treasury around the inadequacy of the percentage allocation to higher education and training?*

**Makgoba:**

*ok I thought that I wouldn't be ask this question but then you remember last year was the fees must fall and then the government has already decided at the university were not sure where they were going to get a fee and the president house that was not going to be a fee increase we were is the NPC we had had our own preliminary meeting as the NPC to identify what*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*were the issues that were going to concern the second phase there were basically three issues and I want to focus on 2, the first one was actually the budgeting process and the alignment of the budget with the priority of the country, that was priority number one that their division and the strategy of the NDP will never be realised as long as we continue to Budget as we have done and our priorities remain lip-service love than actually being real the second one was higher education. was higher education because of the brewing at the time because of the brewing storm of the fees Must Fall we the whole of the NPC then discuss that we must prioritise Higher Education and see if there any ways in which I think it could be sustained it could be stabilized and so forth and we were asked to create a custom within their hand PC we created what is called a budget task team, we looked at their at the National Budget at a time and found that actually it was not*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*aligned with the priorities, we also look with the way- unspent three sources of the budget that occurred there and of course we did find that there was money that were not spend and I can't remember the figure but I do know that whatever we found close to 40 billion of unspent money is in the budget 16 billion of that was allocated to a higher education and that's how you arrived at being able to pay for the zero fee increase of last year it was because there was money is that where understand and the priorities were not completely aligned and there could be corrected so that was a small contribution that the NPC was able to intervene on but the most important thing is this budget alignment of our nation following the priorities of the NDP*

**Pillay:**

*Are there any initiatives in the pipeline to address this non alignment between the content of the budget and –*

**Makgoba:**

*There are initiatives that the NPC and the Department of monitoring and evaluation and the National Treasury working together to look to look at this the framework of budgeting into the future that aligns itself to the NDP.*

**Khumalo:**

*Are there timeframes on that alignment?*

**Makgoba:**

*We have already started on this coming cycle, we are involved so we started our involvement in this cycle, last year we were only able to help in identifying the shortfalls lusty will be able to*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*assist in identifying that's what falls but this year were part of the process in there in there and NDP we are now going through a twist comb through each of the ndb priorities to say when we give you money what have you achieved out of that money? because even that was not an easy thing to find you know I'm not critical of ministers, every minister likes have more money even though they don't know if any of you have done a historic study, if you ask yourself, over the last five years- we have a national budget, and every year at the end of the year, we must account how much of that budget we have spent and how much we have returned to national treasury, if you to look at the unspent money, and what it requires to fund higher education, its no big deal. you don't require to Einstein or a rocket scientist to see that every year we don't spend what we are allocated for because we don't spend it we haven't prioritised it for anything in our objectives or our goal, so if you were to take*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*those kind of things like unspent money, annually- historically you can tell how much South Africa spends on its annual budget. Now what do you want to do with that unspent money? Where do you prioritise it? Do you prioritise it in defense, health or any other department, agriculture, you name them. So every year we have unspent money, as far as I know we have never heard that as a country we have overspent our budget in the past 22 years unlike the americans. We don't do that, we underspend our budget.*

**Chairperson:**

*The attitude to spending unspent money on priorities is simply a plug in holes.*

**Makgoba:**

*Well, I agree largely with what you're saying judge, all im saying is that when you are trying to look for money like you have to try and find money somewhere, I mean people tell you about tax. But as I say you can go into the history of the country and say "why are we not spending what we are given?" why? Is it because ministers don't know how to budget? or is it the priorities of the Minister are actually not relevant to what they want to do it then why do they want to have money and then if you were to go back to come back even without trying to get account if you have to say Ok you didn't spend R10 of the hundred rands that I gave you you spend R90 if you were do then asking how did you spend the R90, you may still find that there are lots of gaps in that so so accountability in the budget has also been lags and it's another way is another source that you may find quite interesting to explore.*

**Chairperson:**

*What happens to the unspent money?*

**Makgoba:**

*It gets returned-*

**Chairperson:**

*It gets returned and budgeted in the following year.*

**Makgoba:**

- *But there it wasn't spent. So I don't really know what are the principles that govern money that is unspent but we know that it gets returned to the national treasury. And of course im talking about the national budget, there is the provincial budget, local budget, so there are all kinds of places where money can be looked for, that's why I mentioned the case of England where the*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*local counsels take responsibility of the education of the children that live in their counsel so it's a local government but it plays an important role in the education of their children. in this country as soon as you raise that the local people tell you no no no no no tertiary education is a competent of national government so they can keep your money so we have also have policies that contradict each other in the provision of the budget.*

**Pillay:**

*Prof, are you aware whether or not the DHET underspends? As a department.*

**Makgoba:**

*I think they do underspend, I don't know at what percentage. I don't know any government department that overspends. I think the defense*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*may be the only one that threatens to overspend but I don't know any, but its because they buy frigets and very sophisticated machines and so on. But they and ofcourse I think their re-organisation is quite costly also of defending the rest of South Africa also.*

**Pillay:**

*Can we just go back to the question of targets and we know the targets set out in the NDP are quite aggressive, it meentions that by 2030 South Africa will have more than 10 million university graduates. It mentions there will be 400 000 new university graduates each year that one in six people will be a university graduate, now we just want to find out what the consequences of growing the higher education sector and Vocational and Community education training sector, so the consequences of growing this sector so quickly it grows, was this discussed by the NPC?*

**Makgoba:**

*Well those were suggestions that came from the department themselves and they were debated with the NPC and they were accepted. I don't think that, remember that since 1995 or when the first white paper came out of the banqu era, on the transformation of higher education, massification of higher education and access were the issues an I think the last white paper that was produced under Dr Nzimade was just an expansion, a refinement of the projections of what we are seeing by the people who do the modelling, I don't think anybody felt that the expansion was rapid and I think that was realistic. And it could be accommodated because remember the expansion is not simply having Consequences of two rapids consequences, but it also go consequences of being able to provide you with professional with skilled people with innovative people so that spin-offs that are going to come during this process is not just going to be in or producing*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*cattles or sheep or whatever people that are sitting there and waiting for jobs of them will be job creators of innovation creators of industry and sell for small and medium industry but there but I think in terms of their expansion it was projected I think it was properly model and I think the department was quite comfortable with those projections.*

**Pillay:**

*There was consideration given to whether or not the economy could absorb such a large number of graduates?*

**Makgoba:**

*Yes, there was that understanding.*

**Pillay:**

*In relation to to the question of success-*

**Chairperson:**

*Supposing your projections for the economy were much lower than the 5% that you for-saw. so sorry privatise opposing the results for much lower than the 5% that you for sow would there have not been a much smaller take up in the economy of the graduates that were produced and would one not have had to adjust the graduate numbers to the weaker economy?*

**Makgoba:**

*Yes I mean that remember that there will work when you are when you are modelling a 20 year production you your modelling on the pond a basis that its a Dynamic process. for example I mean we had the statistician general lead to project the population of the time based on the models so but whatever you but we achieved 0%*

**Chairperson:**

*I'm trying to say your projected on a 5%, now, lets assume for argument's sake that by 2030 we have only achieved a nill percent, now would we still be able to absorb the number of graduates that you wish to produce during that time?*

**Makgoba:**

*I don't think you could, I mean if you didn't have the growth you need to do-*

**Chairperson:**

*Isn't that what is happening? That we are going to have to reduce our rosie predictions of how many graduates we will have because the economy will not be able to cater for them.*

**Makgoba:**

*There are two ways you can look at that Judge, you can look at it that the economic growth is a cyclical issue, so we are going through maybe a bad cycle and we will recover, we are not going to be poor for ever. So I think that's why these models sometimes they look clever and sometimes they look stupid just depending on where you are in that cycle. So I think at the moment nobody is actually saying that we are going to fail to grow. I have not heard anybody say "this is going to be a doomsy era we are just going to go negative and so forth, remember that actually when the ANC inherited this country, it was not growing, it was in negative growth. So the cycles are there and the cycles form part of the modelling and the projections, and I think being a commissioner, all I can do is to take into account that, I mean there has been a*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*And a modelling from the statistician general that you know we are gradually becoming young country, now do we know that that's gonna be correct by 2030? I don't know but obviously he does that from his background and so forth, but I take your point. And I think that 2030 we will have- will not be able to absorb the graduates.*

**Pillay:**

*And does this mean that the targets set out in the NDP which are tied to a 5% assumption of growth, are those target unrealistic in the current climate?*

**Makgoba:**

*If it was to stay that way but I don't think the economy is going to stay that way so I don't think I'll say they are unrealistic. If it was to stay where it is yes, I have'nt heard it from the*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*finance people saying that you must revise these targets, they have come to the NPC and we have talked to them all the time.*

**Khumalo:**

*So maybe with the re-alignment that you guys are working on, would it stay the same or would it make it better? Considering the re-alignemnt of-*

**Makgoba:**

*I think it when we meet with DPME and maybe national treasury, these are the questions that are often discussed whether, I mean are they still realistic or not, I think if they were not realistic, they are- we would obviously have to do something about that and make a proper public announcement that maybe we got it wrong, we have not yet had that but what we realise as they say is we have made the prediction, we are messing up the target but the*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*money has not followed the targets. And the priorities. So that's something that needs to be done there too because that's part of the targets were never based on the basis that the economy was going to grow, it was also based on the 2 things that there were going to be tradeoffs but the money, the budget was also going to follow the priorities of the NDP.*

**Pillay:**

*Just to follow on that. While the NDP states that the .7% is inadequate, it doesn't quite state what is adequate, so in other words, what percentage of the GDP is the appropriate percentage for higher education and training? On the NPC submission, what is the correct percentage of GDP that should be allocated to higher education and training?*

**Makgoba:**

*I'm trying to figure out where you get the 7.1%  
from can you-*

**Pillay:**

*0.71% I think that is the amount that's reflected  
in the NDP, as being the percentage allocation  
to higher education and training at the  
moment.*

**Makgoba:**

*so repeat the question-*

**Pillay:**

*The NDP says that I don't want that 0.7% is  
inadequate but it doesn't quite state what the  
adequate amount of the percentage should be  
or is and what it should be and what's your  
submissions on that?*

**Makgoba:**

*it's very simple one, if you study the only ECDs country if a if you study the percentage of GDP as a said from the globally there are obviously high investors they like their countries Like Cuba, the average comes to 1.5 so basically that will be the Ideal you know if it's normal let's double the 0,71 to 1.4- 1.5 and invested in education is not provide the stability that we need the certainty that we need And to create a very different kind of a higher education but thats the average*

**Pillay:**

*And this 1.5% with this then cover fee free higher education?*

**Makgoba:**

*No, it will be available to higher education and I think the higher education system will decide how to best use it I think I'm not talking about it*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*really in terms of free higher education I'm talking about it in terms of as an investment in higher education how that get deployed by the system is it different matter of together but we I will fill in law below what Nations invest in higher education and there and it was so hopefully low you shouldn't be parading Education as a priority.*

**Pillay:**

*The 1.5%, you mentioned it's the ideal-*

**Makgoba:**

*It's the average. Not the ideal-*

**Pillay:**

*And has there been a costing of the ideal?*

**Makgoba:**

*No*

**Pillay:**

*So if you accept that the ideal education is a public good, and if you accept the need for quality as accepted as reflected in the NDP, and the need for increased infrastructure, what percentage of GDP should be allocated? As the ideal.*

**Makgoba:**

*As I say, I believe in starting from the law of averages and I suspect that if you were to improve from .71 to 1.4 are you doing is doubling whatever budget is at the moment I don't know what. 71 of the GDP translate into but you just double at I don't think that it would come to 40 billion but I think the system first of all the system would gain confidence that the country wants to*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*have such a system it so it will be to be a facilitator a mechanism to give confidence and stability into the system and allow I think you are the academic staff and other people to stay within the system to realise that yes I think we are being valued were being recognised it what been recognised in relation to our peers in other system because you know nations of the world today may sound like a joke compare themselves around the quality of the higher education system they have, you know I was in the West Indies about two weeks- 2 years ago you know what the children in the West Indies asking your parents why is it that there is no university in the West Indies that is ranked should we leave the West Indies and go to where investor and so the world of interconnectivity and and what is going on in globalisation is creating a different pressure on the system on parents and on children so so the*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*issue even in South Africa now some parents are wondering should I be sending my children to overseas because some of our universe is not recognise this is a big issue and it can only be answered if it is seen that the country is determined to invest in the quality of its educational in the future of its children.*

**Pillay:**

*But in the current context, if confidence and stability can only be achieved by meeting the demand, for fee free higher education and training. Is it your submission Prof that you should provide fee free higher education and training for?*

**Makgoba:**

*I often say things as simple I wish it was that simple for me to answer that question - my own analysis as I said to you and submitted*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*before I think free higher education is possible in South Africa because there are many mechanisms and methods you can use to get to Free higher education in South Africa however the current the current noise and the current conversation is not helpful ok that is clearly a deadlock between students government at the universities and people are not talking to each other people are talking across each other that's one Dimension and actually there the conversations sometimes it's like he's like debating something without having a common understanding what you are debating about sometimes I find it that way when I listen to the to the radio that people actually swearing each other and they think they are debating theres no debate because people don't have a common understanding where they want to get to and there for the conversation across each other towards*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*each other I do believe that I don't believe that the students have dark the hills and they don't seem to be able to compromise but I also believe that the University vice-chancellor have run out of ideas they don't know what to do I'm not sure I think government is trying but they have limit as to how they can try because the university autonomous, there are limitations as to what they can do but really the current debate I think if it says that deadlocked and and maybe maybe a commission such as yourself you provide that kind of a valve to let off steam that's why I'm going to come and demonstrate here and terrify people it's part of that steam letting but but in general but I do believe that somehow the students in the university vice-chancellor they will not sit in the same room and there needs to be an intermediary where I think students must be asked what is the bottom line they want and and the question I want to pose is this: if we give free education*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*to students in South Africa what are they going to do has anybody asked that question students? because we may give them free education and they want something else we haven't asked what is the bottom line If I give you free education are you going to go back to classes are you going to stop striking are you going to try and be excellent in what your doing None of these questions are being asked, all we get is give us and we take and take and take we is adult educationist call us whatever you want we have not as the Student what is the contribution to what they are demanding when it has occurred and I think that question would to be ask my somebody what are they going to do I do it either we gonna still have instability University I don't know and nobody is asking the student-*

**Ally:**

*Maybe further Prof, in Durban we asked them, and they said "no, this is only part of the struggle" the free education. We still coming with others, no body knows what those others mean. But I understand where you are coming from in terms of the debate with the students. And that debate needs to take place in terms of that.*

**Makgoba:**

*I just want to- I think the whole is mediated in a manner as I said to you, you might achieve free education but find you have no system to take them. And that's what worries me, that the system at the moment it is so traumatised that it may have reached a point where it will take time to recover. And theres a price to pay for that too which it will have to come from some kind of resources so somewhere the needs to be some interventions that allows conversations to continue rather than you*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*know where all talking through the media we don't sit in a room and see you know let's sit together with the students at the moment I understand that the President is meeting with an Imbizo the students are not there in the Imbizo i don't know I'm just saying we have this conversation so I don't I don't really know but we need to come together somewhere and have a conversation as to what we want how we want to progress I think I say as a nation in conversation to reach some understanding of the path we can take I think this commission is doing that and is part of the process that I think advocate Ally tried to mention that the beginning so somehow we need that process to start at the moment we don't have it and it's frightening.*

**Chairperson:**

*In regard to the emphasis you've placed on the public good of the education, is it your view therefore that there's insufficient private good at education to justify requiring students to pay-contribute towards their education financially?*

**Makgoba:**

*Somebody said somebody must pay somewhere, in education like in many of the things, somebody has to pay somewhere, now how you structure the contributions of students when they have been educated is something that is part of the consideration because the system needs to be sustained somehow.*

**Chairperson:**

*So you don't rule it out?*

**Makgoba:**

*No, im not ruling it out that when people have been provided for, they need to contribute back I really don't think contributing back to the society can be structured in a clean way that allows everybody to understand that as part of this conversation, I grew up that way too.*

**Pillay:**

*You've said that fee free higher education is possible, and I just want to get for a moment to the question of whether its desirable, fee free higher education and training. Because we have had through the presentation before us us had submissions being made that implementing fee free higher education and training at this stage will benefit the rich in our society because they have easy access to universities than poor people do, infact in the way our society is structured at the moment. Do you have any submissions or views on that?*

**Makgoba:**

*I don't buy that view that if you provide free higher education it will only benefit the rich, I think if you provide it equally to all, it would provide opportunity for children that are capable and that have got the energy and enthusiasm. I think we make this a very simplistic statement. Not all children of rich people actually want to be in higher education, we all know that and even those that are forced by their parents to be in higher education, not all of them are successful, and there many children of poor people that are still driven by the opportunity to remove themselves from the traps they are, that become even more successful in higher education. So I think this argument of rich and poor is to me requires a little bit more facts and than just be used as a blunt statement I think you should provide it to everybpdy because, you know my late father used to say to me: when you invest into education, you are investing in something that*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*is invincible, by that he meant that you don't know where your child is going to end up once they are educated. The only thing you pray for is that they remain responsible citizens. And ofcourse some of them were classic examples of them, you know I was born in Sekhukhune and next to a clinics, and my mother and father always dreamt that if I went to medical school, theres a clinic next on the house so I'll go I'll go into medicine come back and run this Clinic my father would become the Clerk because he was a teacher and then my mother will look after the patients are in the queue. I went to study medicine and I never came back and my parents are not disappointed with me it's is the invisibility of what I was trying to say that you educate a person not because you want certain returns, you educate a person so that they can navigate the complexities of the modern world according to the assessment that will be based on the level of education and their understanding of the world.*

**Pillay:**

*Just aligned to that point, in circumstances where we have already covered that you have one pie, and in South Africa regrettably is a small pie. With many obligations-*

**Makgoba:**

*You think it's a small pie?*

**Pillay:**

*Relatively small pie. And you've got increasing obligations including other socio-economic obligations realising the right to water, housing and etc, in that context and circumstances, should we then sponsor the higher education of students whose parents are wealthy and can afford to pay fees?*

**Makgoba:**

*As ive said, not every child of a person who can afford can do that, but remember we do have a constitution too that will say to you don't discriminate, if you start- some clever lawyer and your colleagues will go to the constitution and say why do you discriminate the rich against the poor? Where do you have that mandate that in South Africa that you are going to devide the population according to the rich and the poor and you are providing for the poor without having a referendum or some kind of a vote as to whether that is acceptable, and that's gonna come from some very clever parents and so forth, so I trying ti disabuse this deviation that may be constitutionally a challenge if you did that?*

**Pillay:**

*And on the assumption that it would be constitutionally permissible to differentiate on the basis and that the right to further education means to different things to different people that the right is different, so if you leave aside the possibility of a legal challenge. Just in terms of principle, because we have been met with the submission that you should not provide fee free higher education to students whose parents can afford to pay fees, especially in circumstances that the government is reprioritising money from other equally lawful obligations.*

**Makgoba:**

*I don't have a problem with that, I would argue this way: if there are parents who can pay for their children, those parents can contribute through the tax system, to the education of everybody, in that case, they put it into a pot of tax and they educate everybody in the country. That's how I would do it rather than actually*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*separate the kids. And there's a further point that maybe it's not often obvious. You know when you are a student at university or higher education institution that is learning, you want to free yourself from the burdens of finances, focus on your studies. And this applies equally, even though you know your mom can afford it, sometimes you don't want to be phoning your mom to say: you haven't paid your money. Because parents are like that you know, you just want to get on. You can imagine, if you went to varsity and knew that all you had to do was study, it would make a difference, psychologically to approach your studies as opposed to I've got to wait for some registration fee, I've got to wait for this pocket money to come, look for this kind of accommodation and so forth, if you knew that all these things are taken care of your attitude and psychology towards your studies is very different.*

**Pillay:**

*Chairperson I see its already 10 past one, may I  
ask for lunch adjournment now?*

**Chairperson:**

*Yes, if it is convenient to you of course.*

**Pillay:**

*Thank you so we will convene at 2 o'clock*

**End of session one**

### Start of second session

**Pillay:**

*Thank you chair person, professor Makgoba we are now in the home stretch, in sure you'll be pleased to know, we are in the home stretch there are few things that we need clarity. The first is just to get back to the targets in the NDP, we notice that the targets envisage large increase in the numbers of the PHD student and the numbers of doctoral graduate and masters students not only for teaching purposes but also for research innovation purposes and the NDP expressly mentions that there has to be an increase in African and women students at post graduate levels. Now was there any discussion on how this was going to be achieved in the absence of structured state assistance for post graduate students. Now we know that the NRF assistance is quite limited, and there is subject to conditionality's are not available freely available to all post graduate students, so in the absence of the NSFAS equivalent for post grad*

**Pillay: \*Continued\***

*students how is it that large number of from poor backgrounds were to proceed to post graduate studies?*

**Makgobo:**

*Ok thanks let me say that this numbers are not large, this are minimum that were calculated on the bases that we want to maintain a sustainable exiting vibrant high education system that links universities with the system of innovation in the country because science and technology in the universities system are often linked in various tenuous way and the calculation really was based on a global comparative study of looking at OEC countries at to where they are in terms of the productions of their PHD the really is enticing sort of the minimum that allow us to reach their cause we knew that we are very far. Let me give you a very clear example, we know that in south*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*Africa of the 100 PHDs that we produce about 70 to 80% are only produced by five universities, so ones you say you want to start producing say 5000 it places a huge burden to those universities that ate already there and it also places a burden that do not seem to have a culture of producing PHD, so we thought that it was realistic now the most impotent thing as I've indicated before was that this target were not simply said by the NDP or the NPC, this where target that's where set by the educationists this were targets where that were set by the scientific community, let me be a little more explicit for an example Micheal kahn has been righting and Advising various ministers of science and technology as to how we can bomb up the production of PHDs in the country. Nico clute and his team have always been righting on how we can the production of PHDs in the country as part of the as part if the qualification fame work and how it impact on knowledge and*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*general and the list goes on so there was a discussion of the people as I say expects in the area but more importantly there was a diction and comments from the ministers in those respective and all of them were made to understand that there are going to be financial implications, the reason why I think we put in and we didn't put in targets of women and blacks was simply because we were grounded on the constitutional imperative of access and accrete as part of the driven force without placing targets into the system not knowing how each of the institutions are going to respond. Now let's be real now let's come to a classic example, when I was vice chanc at UKZN the qualifications for the staff when we started only 35% of the staff had PHDs and obviously we knew that we repair extra money to do that and this is the point I was trying to drive it the budget was not going to increase but what did we do?*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*As the executive we sat together and said do we want to improve the quality of the PHD staff in the university, the answer was yes, we went to the senate, we went to the various structures of the university, do you want this? Yes. How can we do it if we don't have extra money from the government? And what did they say? Top slice the budget and devote it to the development of the PHDs. So we never got the extra money but we were asked to top slice the general budget that comes from the government and prioritise it to the studies of the PHD staff by the time I left it was 55%. so we were one of the institutions that moved up as the result of not getting more budget but just prioritising that budget with determination and consultation. Now if you go to the department of science and technology, the minister of science and technology actually created a new program of doctoral, of chairs of research in science and technology to try and draw up*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*excellent young people, but also to try and draw up young student that could study under that, is a new, they are called research chair in south Africa and the department of high education itself has now set about the budget that allows for the training of staff in high education so they are begging in to, I think they are beginning to implement that target in their own way.*

**Pillay:**

*The question there professor is whether or not NPC coincided the finding mechanism to achieve the goal of obtaining more PHDs more doctorates, more masters students particularly for those who comes back from the disadvantaged background.*

**Makgoba:**

*Well the simple answer is no but the minister understood that they'll be financial implications to deal with those targets, and they had to do it in their own way.*

**Pillay:**

*And from that answer are you saying that it was expected that the department and the ministry of high education would coincide such a mechanism and impairment such a mechanism?*

**Makgoba:**

*They have already, I've given you two examples from both departments that actually have to deal with the targets that have been raced, yah*

**Pillay:**

*Just, very briefly the second issue which we wanted to ask you questions about is the question of infrastructure, now the NDP recognises that increased enrolments would require expanded university infrastructure and what we wanted to ask was whether there was any discussions on how this infrastructure exaction would take place we would fund infrastructure department.*

**Makgoba:**

*Well there are already mechanism for both departments of budgets that are allocated to infrastructures where the university systems as far as I now I don't know of other sectors of the post-secondary school education where in the university system we are already competing infrastructure budget that is allocated bu the department high education or the department of science and technology those mechanisms already exists.*

**Pillay:**

*On the question for infrastructure on of the points that were made in the NDP is that universities that have the impudent culture if research and development should be strengthened, now over the course of us receiving submissions from particularly the historic disadvantage universities, ther was a complained raised that emphasis on research based universities disadvantaged universities were previously disadvantage because obviously they don't have such strong culture of research as the traditional universities do, was that conceded when you looked as this question?*

**Makgoba:**

*Yah I think you know some of this things are philosophical and others are again choices, you know the university of cape town didn't wake up one day and found itself as a research institution in our country, it went through iteration of learning proses to absurd the*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*culture of research. Now if I had to contest it with one of the universities none of these things are going to appear by you giving money, they are going to appear by having a university decide on its niche and its goals and being funded for what it can contribute to the totality. So in the NDP there are phrases there that say each university must choose its niches because they are not all capable of doing the same thing. You know and I used to tell people that at the university of KwaZulu Natal we cannot have the best mining engineering in Natal there are no mines there we can teach it because there are textbooks but it will fall short of competitiveness, but we've got lots of sugarcane that's they don't have at Wets so they can't study sugarcane better than we do, so there are these niches for which we can compete, for which we can generate knowledge to support industry and industry supports us, so all of those things were looked at the idea was*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*not to disadvantage but the idea was not all of us are the same even if I wanted it this will never be that same as the university of Limpopo they've got different histories they are located in different province they have different cultures that exist in there and the idea of NDP was lets support the identified goals within that institution and be funded rather than say everybody is the same and therefore you going to be subjected to this. I think if you read the chapter well that comes quite through very well.*

**Pillay:**

*But doesn't the existing funding model for institution for institutions models that are used buy the department, doesn't that work on the opposite way, were infect it does benefit universities that have a strong structural research oppose to those who don't?*

**Makgobo:**

*Advocate Pillay, I struggled this morning though try and tell this commission that we all have had a vision but we didn't think how are we going to carry out the vision, I don't like the current funding model it does exactly what you say but it is because we never set down and entourage it and say if we are going to change the system, how are we going to change the funding model. And all the happens is that the funding model persists and all the you do is patch it on this side and that side and you entrench the very system that you trying to transform and trying to change, I totally agree with you it has not been thought very well and it needs a fundamental recall so that you can allow institution and say I've got 25 institution they are not the same they are not going to be the same for a very long time. I ask in each institution in the bases of autonomy and academic freedom that we have a country that we are trying to construct, in what way can you make the best contribution*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*that can be supported? And then we draft the funding processes to allow each institution to survive rather than assume that intuition must be the same and if we drive them through this formulaic model we will achieve that to be that they'll never be.*

**Pillay:**

*And in an overall of funding model it that in the pipe line?*

**Makgoba:**

*They tried to overhaul it under deputy president Ramaphosa and they produced the same thing, so is not on the pipe line but obviously I think it's totally inappropriate, it just reproduces the old system.*

**Pillay:**

*Just probably second or third final point, professor Makgoba is that one of the issues that you face trimly on the NDP is the emphasis on quality and the proposal that the university that should offer extra support under prepaid learners to improve the throughput rate,*

**Makgoba:**

*Yah.*

**Pillay:**

*And to help learners cope with the demands of high education, now what kind of support did the MPD consider in setting this as an ideal for universities, and was there any costing of those programs considered in other worst who shod be the cost of this programs?*

**Makgoba:**

*First of all I think the costing of any university is born out within the budget of the university maybe we should ....eeeh. And secondly there are many mechanisms and many studies and what id say many pilots studies that have occurred playa to the Doan of democracy that many universities already championed other former university of natal, the former universities of wit waters rand which I know very well that provides good model for the development of under prepared students, unfortunately they have not been rolled country wide. But actually what is funny most of us talk more about under prepared students nobody talks about underprepared staff, ok and I say this because when I was a young student I attended a school where all my teachers were Africans the first time I went to a class were to be thought by a white man I was very disorientated, I was envious I didn't know whether when I answer them I'm speaking*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*correctly and so forth. So there is part of it that the staff is also not prepared to teach in diverse classes of differently prepared kids, and think that there is little attention paid to that but there are enough models within the south African system that have been gained even prior to 1990 as I say I know adversity we have a very good academic models I know at the former natal they used to have that I suspect that in other institutions they did have but I can't guarantee, so those models are there and they will be born by the current budget, but if more budget is needed I think institutions are free I think to apply for budgets within the department cause there are so called developmental budgets within the department. But there are also I think donor institutions like carnegy they support very large programs at various universities that have got to do with academic development of under prepared students.*

**Pillay:**

*And the just moving along briefly to the.....*

**Makgoba:**

*To the?*

**Pillay:**

*TVETs- now the NDP recognises the the collage  
suffer poor reputation due to the low rate of  
employment of college graduate and it  
articulates vision of that collage to be  
strengthen to become institution of choice, now  
there is no indication however on the NDP of  
how this can will be realised, what measure to  
be put into place to converge to a deviate  
college and to collage of choice, was there any  
discussion on the NPC around the .....*

**Makgoba:**

*That is the responsibility of the department of high education and not of the NPC. I think what the NPC was signalling was that and I have my own opinion on this maybe I say this at the end. I think the NPC was signalling that the high educational system is broader than the university system the high education system suffers from the fact as you say that we don't seem to prioritise vocational education in South Africa and there was a need for that to be developed I think through the department of high education, and in fairness in you where to see the focus of minister Ndzimande around the deviate and their reputation and their funding, I think he has taken that recommendation very strongly and they are beginning to work along those lines but what was important to the NPC was to signal the importance of that as part of diversity but also as part of that we are beginning to run short of artisans in the country and we are not going to replace them through*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*the university system but through the  
.....system, and as I say, I think minister  
Ndzimande has taken this issue very strongly  
and at the moment I think he's busy promoting  
it within the system.*

**Khumalo:**

*Advocate Pillay, can I interrupt you on the  
proposal for post school funding, was that list  
exhaustive we spoke mostly with the NSFAS the  
extension of NSFAS but are looking at other  
possible funding?*

**Makgoba:**

*No, I think in fairness advocate Khumalo, as I  
say I don't know maybe I, maybe there was part  
of it we took for granted, when you had to right  
complex documents that is national  
development plan and I keep saying this to  
people, you know at one stage or another we*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*had over 300 proposals concrete proposals of what we must do, and as the NPC we had to seat down and see how do we prioritise them, how do they trade off against each other, and what is already in the ground that can be used to accelerate the system rather you break down the whole house and think you can start it from scratch while you can leave few walls around, so things like NSFAS where already there we understood that there were problems in the NSFAS it was not with or disproblem but we thought that it could be easier to fix them rather than come up with new alternatives that will require formal consultation processes, all the stakeholder coming in, and in the process kids needs to be educated, so I think in short we didn't*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*consider many alternatives cause we that which is nit brakeless try to fix it here and there and accelerate the processes rather than create some new alternative funding's.*

**Pillay:**

*Did the NPC looked the inappropriate of the contingency law on the system, whether or not beneficiaries of NSFAS funding should be required to pay back or not?*

**Makgoba:**

*I think that we were assured that something that is already been conceded, in fact in the time then we were doing the NDP there was a small commission within the department of high education and training that was looking into the whole NSFAS review just like there was commission to look at this funding formula, but at least as I say we came up with the decked*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*formula that was just reproducing the old system in the new dispensation which is a lot of what we are doing in south Africa we have inherited the old system but we just legitimising in in the new system and we think we have a new country we actually playing a new game with the old rules and that's where we get stuck*

**Pillay:**

*Many of the students formations have appeared for commission that's far professor Makgoba, have complained bitterly about the contingency law methodology and they feel strong that poor students who get NSFAS funding should not require pay back and then the funding should be in a form of a grand, do you have any comments about that?*

**Makgoba:**

*I'm not sure if I understand, their complain is that they should get a grand and get scored free?*

**Pillay:**

*That's right they shouldn't be required to pay back.*

**Makgoba:**

*I don't think id agree with the society that doesn't understand that when you invest in the in the future each generation invest in the future, we don't just have hand outs and you stop I think generations invest in the future of the next generation, part of the reason why your this commission is that your trying to find the best mechanism to invest in the future of this generation and it will be wrong for them to think that something can be invested in them and for them it is hunky dory.*

**Pillay:**

*Well one of the things they raised clearly professor Makgoba, is what's called black tax for black graduates once they start earning for what they have studied for many years, they now have the obligation to attend family members who are far more financially variable than they are and for that reason that should be taken into account and they should not be required to pay back.*

**Makgoba:**

*First of all let me say that there's been very little evidence or studies that they have been done on this so called black tax and I'll make this point, you mustn't allow the commission to become where people come and make you feel guilty, I think we are looking at he much bigger societal problems rather than enjoined guilty in all of you, I know that we all are black we've suffered*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*but we still have still have to learn to rise above our blackness in order to do things that are impotent to imbeds into the future of the country otherwise we will not do much buy things like back tax, I think all of us grew up in families were we had to take care of our families and some of them are still doing that but there is no way you can reduce it to the point where it almost instead of making the society to be more cohesive it becomes divisive and it device society, I think we must be very carefully I mean the constitution has enjoyed us to form a socially cohesive society and by implication it means all of us have suffered in one way or another and what we must do is to find instruments that will bring us together rather than solutions that policies us, because if you start having black tax is not gonna stop because blacks will be there all the time they are no suddenly going to be transformed into something else, they are always going to be*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*there, and when is it gonna stop are you going to say maybe 10years, 15years, 20years we will always be black. I used to tell people when I was at UKZN that there one thing I cannot transform, I cannot transform myself from being an African I'll always be an African.*

**Chairperson:**

*Can I put it slightly different way, don't worry for the moment for being black or African, I was a white person who grew up with two parents none of them have been to the university and I also was expected to look after my parents when I was able to do so, some do some don't it maybe a large number of Africans do as compared to white people but some people in some societies support their parents in that way and it's the cycle thing whether the tax whether our education system should take account is another question.*

**Makgoba:**

*No I agree initially with you judge I don't have anything more to say, it's just people are not the same all though we grew up in similar societies as blacks we have totally different values or what to do about are future in our parents and I think if we are gouging to think about it in general terms I think as I say we started in 1994 we wanted to create a socially cohesive society and when we find solutions try and not to get solutions that are not divisive and dividing the nation and perpetuation the pain of one against the other.*

**Chairperson:**

*And I'm sure Mr .... Wouldn't say anything about it but knowing the Indian society in South Africa they are very family, aren't it? They support their parents and their grandparents so I can see these things across all sorts of racial barriers.*

**Makgoba:**

*That's true.*

**Pillay:**

*And this is really penultimate point professor Makgoba, just another question, just on just on private provided education, how does the NPC view the role private providers of education and we see that the NDP suggest consideration should be given to extending NSFAS to students in private collages for example, can you extend on this?*

**Makgoba:**

*I think some on you might know that there was a minister of education called Cada Asmal who unfortunately has died and I think he was very much against private education in private providers of education and I think I share the same view in the country that is developmental*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*that has got lot of iniquity as we have, I did not believe private education will be the way to go by but it is the reality that is there and therefore I think as the NPC it would not be fair I think to discriminate supporting some children that may have found access to that avenue of education because we also realised that not everybody can be in public schooling system but never the less if they are there and they deserve to be given a chance we felt it was necessary I think to support them.*

**Chairperson:**

*We have had professor about 200 000 people go too private high education institutions in south Africa over wide range of different providers, they seem to go there either because they get bursaries or they can afford to go there and they choose to go there, is there no room for both sides?*

**Makgoba:**

*Well as I say I think there is a room for both side judge, but when we were discussing it I think as I say in the NPC I think the was overwhelming view of how to deal with the past because as toupee already said the reality is there but the idea was not to allow it to flourish too much because it can round the public system and create a division rather than a cohesion, maybe that's how it was put rather than totally shut down but there were people who were obviously totally against it but it is a reality of our time and I think it will be there it is how we deal with it as a society such that as I said it doesn't create this big divisions in society.*

**Pillay:**

*Just the point to final point professor Makgoba is around the 0%, you testified that the NPC was instrumental in finding the funding necessary for the no fee increment decision of 2015.*

**Makgoba:**

*That is correct we were involved in that actually I check that budget team the budget task team or the NPC that to re look into that but it was the NPC the department of monitoring and evaluation and treasury that came together in order to relook into the crises as it was then how to we deal with the no fee increases.*

**Pillay:**

*And to what extend did the universities contribute towards the funding of the 0% increase.*

**Makgoba:**

*I don't think they contributed anything, I think that they were just very happy to know that there are not going to be any free increases and the government was going to bare the grown of it.*

**Pillay:**

*I think some of the submissions that we have received showed that those universities that could pay contributed toward funding the 0% decision.*

**Makgoba:**

*Ok let me put it this way we were asked to set up a budget task team jointly with the department of monitoring and evaluation and national treasury to look into that, now when the when the president announce that here was going to be a 0fee increase it was then left to the department of high education and training*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*to translate that into the mechanism that were going to be to be given to each of the universities, now in not very familiar to how that was done just like or an example just like when they say there is going to be an 8% increase its going to affect different universities in different ways like I heard the vice.....33:48 says almost 90% of students are going to be covered in that I don't think it will be the same situation at wits or UCT or at UKZN so somehow or another they are going to determine their fee increase in relation to their own reality of the student population to its... the general announcement is 8% but how that 8% translates on the ground is different for each university.*

**Pillay:**

*Thank you professor Makgoba your testimony has been very enlightening for all of us, we've got no further questions from our side chair person*

**Ally:**

*Thank you chair. Prof when we were going through your introduction and beginning we spoke about issues of equality and issues transformation, now I know you have an opening in the issue of transformation with regards to the whole issue of fee must fall and if I've read what you just said correctly I tried to indicate that the need to be a balance amongst this whole things, just on the issue of transformation now the students have brought this up and brought it to the floor to say we want free education, free decolonised education so from transformative of transformation point of view, who do we look at*

**Ally: \*Continued\***

*education in the regard, what is decolonisation of education in that with that background in mind.*

**Makgoba:**

*Let me start by saying I absolutely agree with the students, because this is for over 20year, and I say this because, you know education is a means of expressing and transmitting culture and culture is not universal culture is localised extremely localised and as I say education is an expression of that, now when and people like-say there needs to be a decolonisation what they are trying to say is that we have leaved through the periods or period which our education took a queue from a certain type of civilisation that sometimes alienated us from our societies. Imagine a child who grows up in Soweto in the evening and goes to WITS during the day and when during the night he must*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*conduct himself as an African in the township  
and be like all tsotsis that they are there and  
gives us impression get and when he is ha WITS  
he must be proper and sound like a young  
English person now there are not many people  
who leave this skitsofrenic life as part of their  
education where you have one personality  
during the day and another one at night but  
Africans suffered that through out the history to  
all disadvantaged people, now when the kid  
says we want it decolonised in a light sense  
that's what they want, they want an education  
that relates and interacts with their culture and  
that's not the case. Now it's actually not difficult  
how a chines child would be if they had to be  
taught to become young English people it would  
not happen, I think china would go beseech and  
the leadership would be locked up, so on the  
one hand we can see nations that are proud of  
their identity proud of their civilization and they  
integrated their civilization into their education*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*system we have never done that I south Africa  
actually we have two system we have had a  
British missionary system and in not  
commenting whether its good or bad and the  
we've had the Christian education system of the  
Afrikaans not anytime have we ever had African  
education for people who live in Africa. Now we  
are the majority most of us have our dreams  
and our expressions in African languages that's  
not gonna stop because I'm speaking English to  
you this is what they mean by decolonisation  
such that we don't continue to assimilate into a  
cultural system that will forever keep us inferior  
because you can never be better than English  
people in your English as soon as I open my  
mouth in English and English people are  
listening to me they know that I don't speak  
English like them and they are always going to  
be better but if I open my speech in Pedi they  
beginning to feel inferior too. So this thing of  
identity and language and the way you think*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*are much deeper than what we see because we have send our children to universities and really that's what this kids are saying and many African scholars have written about this and unfortunately is part of what I'm saying when I say we have inherited a country trying to make a new country but I think we can create it by the old rules if we don't rules fundamentally then if we agreed let's forget ourselves and lets just become white man in black skin that's fine we can do that by concensers.*

**Ally:**

*Well then Proff in relation to that does that discussion take place within the NPC and when drafting the NDP because I would imagine, it is and important question within discussing education as a whole for everybody perhaps but as important as it is to you whilst you cannot force your opinions on everybody else, was it a debate ?*

**Makgoba:**

*Yes it was a debate and actually if you read a chapter on education it is drafted along those lines because it brings issues of curriculum change into the chapter of high education and its precisely about when are we what is our educational system and our identity we want to create out of that system so it was debated yah.*

**Ally:**

*Then Prof we went on to describe quality education and also including quality with the quality of staff that you have cause you thought that it was a necessary deterrent of quality education, now there are those that indicate that the PHD does not necessarily a good lecture for that matter PHD is good for researches and knowledge production, what would you say to that, in terms of do you see it in isolation or it has to be taken in relation such as pedagogics and all the sets of that?*

**Makgoba:**

*I take it, let me agree this way, there is a distinction between a high school, a primary school and a university, a university one thing that distinguishing a university from the rest of schooling system is in its ability to produce innovation and new knowledge and I've shown here through evidence that new knowledge and evidence comes from PHDs like in any society there are always exceptions you may find one person or two but as a general trend which you're going to formulate policies you formulate policies on the basis of strong averages rather than exceptions of few so that's where I'm taking from, if we understand the difference between a university and a high school you'll understand why you need a PHD, if you understand that a university are the top of that education system you understand why you only need teachers to be the teachers and the grounders of the whole education system and you do it better.*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*Now is there a correlation between a PHD and teaching? Yes, the overwhelming majority of studies show that people who have PHDs are often the better teachers not the other way round that they are just simply teachers, people who hold the PHD have and are always better teachers, and they are better teachers because they often teach out of the box they don't teach within the box they know the books but they know how to provide avenues of thinking that a person without a PHD will not provide they teach out of the box and they often best teaches and they often inspire people to think differently to be more creative than people who don't have it.*

**Ally:**

*Then just to return to our discussion in planning cycles and budget and priorities, is the situation not that as government you have what you have, and therefore if you follow our discussion*

**Ally: \*Continued\***

*cause the principle is that budget must follow the priority and not the other way around, but is it not you've inherited the system and you've got perhaps using the constitutional words progressively make it accessible, so as times goes on you make it better and better to reach your goal at the end of the day or is it the situation that you shocked the system and say tomorrow education is free because you can pay for it, are the two mutually exclusive or you can have both of them, one thing tomorrow get rid of this system that you've been using since 1963 the other one saying I can progressively change the system to where I want it to be.*

**Makgoba:**

*Ok I suppose let me answer it with the practical example, when I was appointed at the university of Kwa Zulu natal I had to match the former university of Durban and the former natal and I decided the quicker the more shock the better,*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*but I also understood one fundamental is that even though you want it quick sharp and a shock you must understand that to change a system you must make a choice of what are the shocks quicker because some of the factors that will remain are going to break down as soon as those shocks fall so you don't need to bake the whole house to actually have a change but that is one approach so there will be things in changing the system that requires the approach that you taking of a progressive things, when you do the progressive approach you must define the time frame. What has happened in these situation of fees is that the vision was there the clarity was there but the time frames where fake and therefore people now have become exasperated and tired of hearing whether something was going to happen so if you're going to be progressive be very clear I'm going to do it in five years and I'm going to do it as follows, but if you really are ask me the best*

**Makgoba: \*Continued\***

*approach to change is quick sharp and shock  
and it works, and that's what did at UKZN and it  
worked and I don't regret that I didn't do it  
slowly because I've seen my colleagues who have  
done it slowly they have been frustrated by the  
system.*

**Ally:**

*Thank you Prof.*

**Chairperson:**

*Thank you for the work and preparation and for  
taking the travel to come and present to us is  
much care, we really appreciate that.*

**Makgoba:**

*I also just want to thank I think the commission for giving me the opportunity and the time and questioning that you have provided and as I took the oath I hope that what I've said is what I'd say even if I was put by Froed under a table to sleep and speak so I think I'm fare on that. But more importantly I want to thank the people who assisted me in preparing me for this I think I've got the team of my colleagues from the NPC- John Kruger here and his two interns that assisted me, I also had lots of discussions when I was told I was coming to discuss this with various colleagues I think Nico Clute has been part of that discussion cause we got a long way together in the 1995 when we met at WITS so I want to thank him for that impute that his has made over the time coming to the structure, thank you again.*